The Ethical Dilemma of Mandatory Influenza A Vaccinations for Optometrists

Alexander Conati BS, Richard Walker III BS, James Miller OD FAAO, Michigan College of Optometry

Introduction

- In recent years, vaccinations of all kinds have been a hotly debated topic in media outlets and classrooms alike. Although the dialogue surrounding this topic continues to grow, many of these conversations occur outside the context of moral and ethical philosophy. The purpose of this study is to provide an ethical framework for understanding and evaluating mandatory vaccination policies (specifically Influenza A) in the hopes of ascertaining best practices for implementation and to ensure ethical transparency throughout. An anonymous survey was distributed to students and faculty of the Michigan College of Optometry in order to evaluate opinions of optometrists on the matter. In addition, a non-biased literature review of the ethical philosophy of vaccinations was performed. The basis of the framework was based on the four pillars of medical ethics; non-maleficence, beneficence, autonomy, and justice.

Methods

- 88 total, de-identified respondents completed the five question survey and were asked to provide reasoning behind their decisions for questions 1 and 5. Question 1 was stated as follows: If Influenza A vaccination was deemed optional by your employer, would you choose to get vaccinated? (70.5% Yes, 29.5% No)
- Many of the responses shared similar rationale, the most common of which are summarized below:
  - Personal Protection (33 responses)
  - Herd Immunity (28 responses)
  - Effectiveness (6 responses)
  - Doctor/CDC Recommendations (6 responses)
  - Feasibility (5 responses)
  - Aversion to Needles (2 responses)

Question 5: Should Influenza A vaccinations be mandated for all employees? (69.3% Yes, 12.5% No)
- The most common responses to this question are outlined below:
  - Personal Protection (23 responses)
  - Protecting Special Populations (12 responses)
  - Personal Autonomy (11 responses)
  - Personal Protection (9 responses)
  - Allergy/Medical reasons (6 responses)
  - Socioeconomic Factors (4 responses)

- Additionally, 17 responses directly quoted optometrist’s role in healthcare as a reason for supporting mandatory influenza A vaccination policies.

Results

- This five question research survey was completed by a total of 88 optometrists and optometry students. The results for each question are as follows:

Q1: If influenza A vaccination was deemed optional by your employer, would you choose to get vaccinated?
- Yes: 62
- No: 26

Q2: Would you be more likely to consider vaccination if vaccines were administered at your workplace?
- Yes: 77
- No: 11

Q3: If your employer provided incentive programs for vaccinated employees, would you be more likely to consider vaccination?
- Yes: 77
- No: 11

Q4: If your employer required vaccination as a mandatory condition to employment, would you be more likely to consider vaccination?
- Yes: 84
- No: 4

Q5: Should flu vaccines be mandated for all employees?
- Yes: 62
- No: 26

Acknowledgements

We would like to extend our gratitude to Dr. James Miller for the instrumental role he had in many aspects of the research project as our faculty advisor. The idea and orchestration of this research can be attributed to Dr. Miller.

References